Four-to-Three Decisions

4-3 Alignments

Justices	Total	Case Names
Wickhem, Fritz, Rosenberry, Martin	2	State ex rel. Attorney Gen. v. Fasekas; Welch v. Henry
Fairchild, Fritz, Rosenberry, Martin	1	Powers v. Cherney Const. Co.

4-3 Membership in the Majority

Justice	Votes
Wickhem	2
Fairchild	1
Fritz	3
Rosenberry	3
Fowler	0
Martin	3
Nelson	0

4-3 Majority Opinions Authored

	Opinions
Wickhem	1
Fairchild	1
Fritz	0
Rosenberry	1
Fowler	0
Martin	0
Nelson	0
Total	3

Decisions by Vote Split¹

7-0 (or 6-0)	6-1	5-2 (or 4-2)	4-3
299/322 (93%)	13/322 (4%)	7/322 (2%)	3/322 (1%)
Brown v. Loewenbach	In re Daniels' Will	Stevens Point v.	Powers v. Cherney Const.
		Bocksenbaum	Co.
Buildings Development Co. v. Milwaukee	Kegel v. McCormack	State v. Henderson	State ex rel. Attorney Gen. v.
			Fasekas
Dick & Reuteman Co. v. Jem Realty Co.	Mellen Produce Co. v. Fink	State ex rel. Associated	Welch v. Henry
		Indem. Corp. v. Mortensen	
Employers Mut. Liability Ins. Co. v. Icke	Husting v. Dietzen	Kelley v. Paul Clothing &	
Estate of Elizabet Elizab	Manifest Comments	Shoe Co. McCarthy v. Steinkellner	
Estate of Flierl v. Flierl	Morris v. Sampsell	•	
Estate of George v. United States Fid. &	Markowitz v. Milwaukee	First Wisconsin Nat'l Bank v.	
Guar. Co. [June 21, 1937]	Electric R. & L. Co.	Roehling	
Estate of Koebel v. Koebel	St. Joseph's Hospital v.	York v. Industrial Com. (4-2)	
	Maternity Hospital & Dispensary Ass'n		
Estate of Lube v. Gosse	Trustees of Clinton Lodge v.		
Estate of Euroe v. Gosse	Rock County		
Estate of Penney v. Fowlie	Weinke v. Philgas Co.		
Highway Trailer Co. v. Industrial Com.	Shulse v. Mayville		
In re Phelan	Swanson v. Schultz		
Kundert v. Riese	Egan v. Preferred Acci. Ins. Co.		
Milwaukee v. Burns	Nees v. Weaver		
Neillsville Shipping Ass'n v. Lastofka			
Rahr Malting Co. v. Manitowoc			
Silgen v. Fond Du Lac			
State ex rel. Schroeder v. Board of School			
Directors			
Van Dale v. Prudential Ins. Co.			
Walter v. Baum			
Walter v. Wyk			
Weco Products Co. v. Reed Drug Co.			
Wisconsin Malting Co. v. Manitowoc			
Plankinton Packing Co. v. Cincrete Corp.			
State ex rel. Young v. Maresch			
Wasielewski v. Racke			
Clam River Electric Co. v. Public Service			
Com. Amerpohl v. Wisconsin Tax Com.			
Bartholomew v. Thieding			
Bitter v. Gold Creek Min. Co.			
Cleary v. Batz			
De Groot v. Van Akkeren			
Duss v. Friess			
Ellington v. Industrial Com.			
Estate of Leedom v. Leedom			
First Wisconsin Trust Co. v. Board of			
Trustees			

(continued on following page)

-

¹ In few instances, a justice authored a separate opinion that concurred in part and dissented in part. For this and other tables, each such vote has been categorized as either a dissent or a concurrence according to the following guidelines. If a justice's opinion dissented from the result on one or more issues, it was classified as a dissent. If the opinion concurred with the result on all issues but disputed the majority's reasoning on one or more issues, it was classified as a concurrence.

Hinrichs v. Industrial Com.		
Horlick v. Swoboda		
In re Acme Brass & Metal Works		
In re Doerfler's Will		
In re Guardianship of Farness		
In re Johnston's Will		
In re Pick		
McIntosh v. Wisconsin Tax Com.		
Meyer v. Selover		
Sauk County v. Industrial Com.		
Schwemer v. Citizen's Loan & Inv. Co.		
Stetzer v. Chippewa County		
Tiffany v. Industrial Com.		
Zowin v. Peoples Brewing Co.		
Burke v. Tesmer		
Chitlik v. Industrial Com.		
Egan v. Travelers Ins. Co.		
First Nat'l Bank & Trust Co. v. Plous		
Bros.		
Fuller v. General Acci. Fire & Life		
Assurance Corp.		
Gollon v. Jackson Milling Co.		
Grasser v. Anderson		
In re Sechler's Will		
Kauth v. Landsverk		
Maltby v. Thiel		
Miller v. Estate of Bell		
Montreal Mining Co. v. Industrial Com.		
National Bond & Inv. Co. v. Murphy		
Ratcliff v. Phi Pi Phi Housing Corp.		
Reader v. Frank H. Applegate, Inc.		
State ex rel. Kunz v. Wendt		
Universal Granite Quarries Co. v.		
Industrial Com.		
Witzko v. Koenig		
A. W. Thompson Co. v. Thompson		
Alberti v. Gordon		
Bunda v. Jacobus		
Car & General Ins. Corp. v. Industrial		
Com.		
Cleary v. Brokaw		
Employers Mut. Liability Ins. Co. v.		
Brower C.		
Employers Mut. Liability Ins. Co. v.		
Industrial Com. Estate of Cullen v. First Nat'l Bank of		
Superior Estate of Lagershausen v. Kusta		
Estate of Onstad v. Onstad Gardner v. State		
Hammersberg v. Nelson		
Interstate Dep't Stores v. Henry		
Kedinger v. Heisler		
Keainger v. Heisier Kohler Co. v. Industrial Com. of		
Wisconsin		
Lindokken v. Paulson		
Marathon County v. Industrial Com.		
Musa v. Segelke & Kohlhaus Co.		
Saylor v. Marshall & Ilsley Bank		
(continued on following page)		

Schmitt v. Industrial Com.		
Segall v. Ohio Casualty Co.		
Skrzypczak v. Konieczka		
Trathen v. Lyon		
Trustees, Middle River Sanatorium v.		
Industrial Com.		
Wauwatosa v. Volpano		
Wells Coal & Dock Co. v. Industrial Com.		
Whitefish Bay v. Milwaukee County		
Yates v. Weinhardt		
American Mut. Liability Ins. Co. v. Chain Belt Co.		
Anderson v. Seelow		
Besser v. Hill		
Boldig v. Urban Tel. Co.		
Cremer v. Banking Com.		
Estate of Adams v. Nurnberg		
Estate of Sletto v. Aarness		
Estate of Weiss v. First Nat'l Bank of		
Monroe		
Florida Realty Finance & Sec. Co. v.		
Chris, Schroeder & Sons Co.		
Guardianship of Snyder		
In re Muskat's Will		
Jorgenson v. Sparta		
Larson v. Banking Com. of Wisconsin		
Larson v. Industrial Com.		
Manufactures Trust Co. v. Chris		
Schroeder & Son Co.		
Maynard v. De Vries		
Milwaukee County v. Industrial Com.		
Milwaukee News Co. v. Industrial Com.		
Potter v. Potter		
Schneider Fuel & Supply Co. v. Industrial		
Com.		
State v. Clementi		
Universial Foundry Co. v. Industrial Com.		
Wisconsin Power & Light Co. v. Public		
Service Com. Wisconsin Town Mut. Reinsurance Co. v.		
Wisconsin Town Mut. Reinsurance Co. v. Calumet County Mut. Fire Ins. Co.		
Amberg v. Deaton		
American Nat'l Bank & Trust Co. v. Edith		
Rockefeller McCormick Trust		
Bank of Verona v. Stewart		
Carlson v. Grimsrud		
Consumers Coal & Fuel Co. v. Industrial		
Com.		
Estate of Ryan v. Ryan		
General Acci. Fire & Life Assurance		
Corp. v. Industrial Com.		
Groh v. W. O. Krahn, Inc.		
Hunt v. Dollar		
In re Uggen's Guardianship		
Le Sage v. Le Sage		
Lindsley v. Farmers Exchange Inv. Co.		
Lutzenberger v. Milwaukee Electric R. &		
L. Co.		
Marwalt Realty Co. v. Greene		

Milwaukee County v. Milwaukee		
Mormon v. Douglas County		
New Lisbon v. Harebo		
Pohland v. Zillmer		
Sentinel News Co. v. Industrial Com.		
State ex rel. Madison v. Maxwell		
State ex rel. Pelishek v. Washburn		
Wauwatosa Cemetery Ass'n v. Wauwatosa		
Accola v. Giese		
Banking Com. v. Wiemann		
Bleul v. Milwaukee Electric R. & L. Co.		
Central Wisconsin Trust Co. v. Keating		
Cordts v. Reuter		
Estate of Richardson v. Richardson		
France v. Sullivan		
Gross v. Sommers		
In re Byrne's Will		
In re Jacobson's Will		
In re Le Feber's Will		
In re Norcor Mfg. Co.		
In re Stanley's Will		
Kluck v. State		
Kuenzi v. Leisten		
Nimlos v. Bakke		
Richter v. Standard Mfg. Co.		
Roche v. Du Bois		
Rowland v. Racine		
Schaettle v. State Highway Com.		
Scheffler v. Bartzen		
Scheibe v. Lincoln [223 Wis. 417]		
Scheibe v. Lincoln [223 Wis. 425]		
Smith v. Green Bay		
Szumski v. Szumski		
Walk v. Boudheim		
Warne v. Petzke		
Wauwatosa v. Jacobus & Winding		
Concrete Const. Co.		
Will of Peters v. Odegard		
Wisconsin Sales Corp. v. McDougal		
Bittner v. Miller		
Department of Agriculture & Markets &		
Laux		
Derfus v. Stoelting Bros. Co.		
Eich v. Brennan		
Estate of Bollow v. First Wisconsin Trust		
Co.		
Estate of George v. United States Fid. &		
Guar. Co. [December 8, 1936]		
Estate of Schreihart v. East Wisconsin		
Estate of Seybold v. Seybold		
Estate of White v. Marine Nat'l Exch. Bank of Milwaukee		
Holleb Liquor Distributors, Inc. v.		
Lincoln Fireproof Warehouse Co.		
In re Nieman's Will		
Johnson v. Hasslinger		
Knuth v. Pattarson		
Koetting v. Conroy		
Krudwig v. Koepke		
Kruawig v. Koepke	l	

La Cross Dredging Co. v. Industrial Com.		
Lau v. Harder		
Northern Hotel Co. v. Industrial Com.		
Popp v. Froelich		
Schultz v. Pahlow Oil Co.		
Wacho Mfg. Co. v. Industrial Com.		
Wangerin v. Wisconsin State Board of		
Accountancy		
Wisconsin Tel. Co. v. Milwaukee		
Baackes v. Blair		
Benkert v. Gruenewald		
Blumer Brewing Corp. v. Mayer		
Brochu v. Taylor		
Canzoneri v. Heckert		
Estate of Boyle v. McGalloway		
Estate of Kronglaski v. State		
Federal Life Ins. Co. v. Thayer		
Fredonia Canning Co. v. Sergeant &		
Nicholoy		
Koch v. Transcontinental Ins. Co.		
Kroening v. Kroening		
Milwaukee County v. Badger Chair &		
Furniture Co.		
Milwaukee v. Chicago, M. S. P. & P. R.		
Co.		
Morley-Murphy Co. v. Van Vreede		
Muldowney v. McCoy Hotel Co.		
Northwestern Malleable Iron Co. v.		
McMahon		
Sadlier v. Lay		
Shawano Oil Co. v. Citizens State Bank		
Skiris v. Port Washington		
Thomas v. Kind		
Bass v. Nofsinger		
Bushman v. Tomek		
De Vries v. Dye		
Hansche v. A. J. Conroy, Inc.		
Hare v. Reddy		
Holzinger v. Prudential Ins. Co.		
In re Loewenbach's Will		
In re Radoll's Guardianship		
Judevine v. Benzies-Montanye Fuel &		
Warehouse Co.		
Kilcoyne v. Trausch		
Latsch v. Bethke		
Madison Trust Co. v. Skogstrom		
McKey v. Egeland		
Menge v. Radtke		
Nicolai v. Wisconsin Power & Light Co.		
Rosenbluth v. State		
Stark v. Bredahl		
State ex rel. Central Surety & Ins. Corp. v.		
Belden		
State ex rel. Karnes v. Board of Regents		
State ex rel. Rasmussen v. Circuit Court		
for Kenosha County		
Struck & Irwin Fuel Co. v. Industrial		
Com.		
(continued on following page)		

Vukelic v. Upper Third St. Sav. & Loan		
Ass'n		
Wesemann v. Watertown Milk Co-		
operative Ass'n		
Zindell v. Central Mut. Ins. Co.		
Allen-Bradley Co. v. Industrial Com. (per		
curiam, 7-0)		
Anderson v. Industrial Com. (per curiam,		
7-0)		
In re Will of Elsen (per curiam, 7-0)		
Nys v. Chicago, M., S. P. & P. R. Co. (per		
curiam, 7-0)		
Ryan v. Industrial Com. (per curiam, 7-0)		
Davis v. Davis (per curiam, 7-0)		
Rands v. Prissel (per curiam, 7-0)		
Spindler v. Prissel (per curiam, 7-0)		
Fries v. Lallier (per curiam, 7-0)		
G. Reinke & Co. v. Industrial Com. (per		
curiam, 7-0)		
Hauswirth v. Wittenberg (per curiam, 7-0)		
In re Estate of Shepherd (per curiam, 7-0)		
Sobczynski v. Haraburda (per curiam, 7-		
0)		
Holly v. First Nat'l Bank (per curiam, 7-0)		
In re Estate of Martin (per curiam, 7-0)		
Koch v. Milwaukee Electric R. & L. Co.		
(per curiam, 7-0)		
Peoples Exchange Bank v. Tobola (per		
curiam, 7-0)		
In re Estate of Brusse (per curiam, 7-0)		
Ludwig v. Doern (per curiam, 7-0)		
Mautz v. Bagley (per curiam, 7-0)		
Barrett v. Minneapolis, St. P. & S. S. M.		
R. Co. (per curiam, 7-0)		
Great Northern Life Ins. Co. v. Petersen		
(per curiam, 7-0)		
In re Estate of Happ (per curiam, 7-0)		
Jones v. Bennett (per curiam, 7-0)		
Liebelt v. Hardware Mut. Casualty Co.		
(per curiam, 7-0)		
Marling Lumber Co. v. Industrial Com.		
(per curiam, 7-0)		
Rose v. Stancevic (per curiam, 7-0)		
Board of Education v. Industrial Com.		
(per curiam, 7-0)		
In re Estate of Shinoe (per curiam, 7-0)		
Pawling v. Burlington Blanket Co. (per curiam, 7-0)		
Waukesha Lime & Stone Co. v. Industrial		
Com. (per curiam, 7-0)		
Bitzan v. Rowbottom (per curiam, 7-0)		
Chafee v. Scandrett (per curiam, 7-0)		
[223 Wis. 682]		
Chafee v. Scandrett (per curiam, 7-0)		
[223 Wis. 683]		
De Witt v. Pulchin (per curiam, 7-0)		
Diek v. Pries (per curiam, 7-0)		
In re Estate of Sherwin (per curiam, 7-0)		
Krueger v. Thielen (per curiam, 7-0)		
(continued on following mass)		

Mattson v. Koch (per curiam, 7-0)	1	l I
Miller v. Melin (per curiam, 7-0)		
Runngren v. Berg (per curiam, 7-0)		
Rusecky v. Shimkus (per curiam, 7-0)		
Direct Service Oil Co. v. Wisconsin Ice &		
Coal Co. (per curiam, 7-0)		
Fraternal Order of Eagles v. Industrial		
Com. (per curiam, 7-0)		
Hudson Sharp Machine Co. v. Industrial		
Com. (per curiam, 7-0)		
In re Estate of Euler (per curiam, 7-0)		
In re Estate of Post (per curiam, 7-0)		
In re Will of Nelson's (per curiam, 7-0)		
Schmidt v. Marty (per curiam, 7-0)		
Borah v. Hall (per curiam, 7-0)		
Gerum v. Pfister (per curiam, 7-0)		
Sukow v. Radke (per curiam, 7-0)		
Vekich v. Hall (per curiam, 7-0)		
W. T. Raleigh Co. v. Greene (per curiam,		
7-0)		
McCaffrey v. Minneapolis S. P. & S. S. M.		
R. Co. (per curiam, 7-0)		
Newbern v. State (per curiam, 7-0)		
Rosecky v. Tomaszewski (6-0)		
Gardner Baking Co. v. Public Service		
Com. (6-0)		
Koscuik v. Sherf (6-0)		
Riley v. State Bank of De Pere (6-0)		
Wright v. Wrightstown-Morrison Farmers		
Mut. Ins. Co. (6-0)		

Frequency in the Majority

These tables display how frequently each justice voted in the majority. The first table includes all cases in which a justice voted, while the second table includes only cases decided by split votes.

All Cases

Justice	Majority Votes Cast	Total Votes Cast	Percent in Majority
Wickhem	314	320	98%
Fairchild	313	322	97%
Fritz	316	322	98%
Rosenberry	322	322	100%
Fowler	315	322	98%
Martin	315	318	99%
Nelson	317	322	98%

Non-Unanimous Decisions

Justice	Majority Votes Cast	Total Votes Cast	Percent in Majority
Wickhem	16	22	73%
Fairchild	14	23	61%
Fritz	17	23	74%
Rosenberry	23	23	100%
Fowler	16	23	70%
Martin	20	23	87%
Nelson	18	23	78%

Opinions Authored²

The first table indicates how many majority opinions a justice authored in cases decided by each of the four possible majority vote totals. The second table shows how many concurrences and dissents each justice wrote. If a justice dissented without authoring an opinion, he is not credited.

Opinion Author	7-0 (or 6-0)	6-1	5-2 (or 4-2)	4-3
Wickhem	34	1	4	1
Fairchild	36	3	0	1
Fritz	35	1	0	0
Rosenberry	40	3	0	1
Fowler	35	3	2	0
Martin	22	2	0	0
Nelson	40	0	1	0

Opinion Author	Concurring Opinions	Dissenting Opinions
Wickhem	0	2
Fairchild	1	8
Fritz	1	1
Rosenberry	0	0
Fowler	1	4
Martin	0	0
Nelson	0	1

² *Per curiam* decisions are omitted.

Agreement Among Pairs of Justices

The following tables show the percentage of decisions in which every possible pair of justices found themselves on the same side—either both in the majority or both dissenting. The first table covers all decisions; the second table narrows its focus to decisions that were not unanimous. When reading the <u>second</u> table, for instance, one finds that Justices Fritz and Fowler voted together in 43% of the decisions, while the figure for Justices Wickhem and Rosenberry was 73%.

Agreement Between Pairs of Justices—All Decisions

	Fairchild	Fritz	Rosenberry	Fowler	Martin	Nelson
Wickhem	308/320= 96%	308/320= 96%	314/320= 98%	311/320= 97%	308/316= 97%	311/320= 97%
	Fairchild	309/322= 96%	313/322= 97%	310/322= 96%	310/318= 97%	312/322= 97%
·		Fritz	316/322= 98%	309/322= 96%	309/318= 97%	313/322= 97%
			Rosenberry	315/322=98%	315/318= 99%	317/322= 98%
				Fowler	308/318= 97%	318/322= 99%
					Martin	310/318= 97%
						Nelson

Agreement Between Pairs of Justices—Non-Unanimous Decisions

	Fairchild	Fritz	Rosenberry	Fowler	Martin	Nelson
Wickhem	10/22= 45%	10/22= 45%	16/22= 73%	13/22= 59%	14/22= 64%	13/22= 59%
	Fairchild	10/23= 43%	14/23= 61%	11/23=48%	15/23= 65%	13/23= 57%
		Fritz	17/23= 74%	10/23= 43%	14/23= 61%	14/23= 61%
			Rosenberry	16/23= 70%	20/23= 87%	18/23= 78%
				Fowler	13/23= 57%	19/23= 83%
					Martin	15/23= 65%
						Nelson